Thermionic Valve Analogue Stages for Digital Audio

A short overview of the Subject by Thorsten Loesch

1. Introduction

In the last decade the whole issues been to interface the Silicon nastiness of CD-Players and Digital to Analogue Converters to Valve Equipment has received extensive coverage in the hobbyist and Hi-Fi Press. Many Audiophiles and Valve Amplifier Constructors have even introduced add on Valve Stages claiming them to be "the missing links" and the like. This brief article shall not concern itself with the polemic surrounding the issue, or with specific circuits of many implemented solutions.

Nor shall we discuss the inherent futility of attempting to "colour" or "improve" by introducing Valves, a Digital Audio Format which not only suffers from enough distortion, but is designed to be "distortion" absolutely impossible and for which the vast majority of recordings we can make use of the available quality. Nor shall the issues of massively incompetent digital design (clock jitter, PSU decoupling, managing of RF Noise and so on) to almost all commercially available equipment be discussed in length.

Before continuing with this Article the aspect reader is advised to make herself or himself comfortable with the underlying principles of Digital Audio and CD Format as no further consideration will be given to this topic.

Instead we shall concern ourselves only with delivering the however compromised output Signal from the Digital to Analogue Converter to the Output Jack so that it is suitable for further processing.

Considering this task, the use of Zero Feedback circuits seems almost mandatory. This is because with a DAC or CD Player we deal with a generator of massive levels of wideband RF Noise. And such a generator is connected to the Input of our Valve Stage via the Output of the intermediation distortion. This is easily observable with noise-load testing such as much as 1% with leading High End Converters and worse for much inferior equipment.

So, having defined the almost absolute need for zero feedback circuits if our goal is to offer high fidelity without recourse to repeated design improvements, we are left with the problem of finding a suitable circuit. Such circuits are not to be found in many books on valve design for the ability to offer low enough distortion and bandwidth for Digital Audio is a relatively recent development.

Now, how do we introduce wide valves circuits to the kind of DAC Chip's commonly found in consumer digital equipment? To answer this we must first understand that currently two fundamentally different DAC Architectures are being used and that the two different Architectures require a different Interfacing circuit approach to analogue stage design. The two DAC architectures in question are multibit and (multibit and bitstreaming DAC's. Let's look at the technology:

2. Multibit Digital To Analogue Converters

The Multibit DAC is the classic Schottkey and Ohm Technology and has been beginning and a very long history outside digital audio. In most simple terms a Multibit DAC contains a number of switches and a resistor network (and some auxiliary circuitry). Each of the switches corresponds to a "Bit" and each switch is either open or closed depending on whether the corresponding Bit is "1" or "0".

If take the classic Philips TDA 1541 Multibit DAC as example, the SMD circuit significant Bit will toggle on or off a Switch which will switch on or off a current of 2mA. The next Bit will switch on or off a current of 1mA and so on down to the Least Significant Bit which switches a current of 2mA current and represents basically "digital silence". Switching all other 15 Switches on will add another 2mA to the total now bringing the output to 4mA. Switching on all Switches will bring the total to 8mA. Now, if we connect the Output Pin to a Resistor to Ground, we will have a voltage proportional to the digital word. Such a Circuit is called a Current to Voltage Converter and is the basis of many DAC's, even Bitstreaming DAC's, as we shall see.

At the current is normally derived from a reference voltage via precision trimmed resistors the output needs to be amplified to a level fit to make and hence a used introducing considerable distortion. Even with Zero Feedback circuits and Valve Amplification this is a factor that is to be avoided if at all possible.

Commonly used is a op-amp chip where the output current of the DAC is applied to the inverting input of the Op-Amp, which due to it's extreme high open loop gain will keep the Input at Virtual Earth. The Output voltage will be proportional to the Input current. Such a Circuit is called a Current to Voltage Converter and is the basis of many DAC's, even Bitstreaming DAC's, as we shall see. Such a Circuit is called a Current to Voltage Converter which only suitable as agglomerations, clipped silhouette and similar artifacts that are relatively hard to measure, using conventional methods.

In many existing Philips CD-Players and DAC's based on the TDA 1541 DAC and subsequent derivatives, the Output Pin of the DAC is connected to the Input of an incredibly ill suited for this purpose and no doubt the often less than ideal sonical character of early CD-Players can be blamed at these devices. Such a configuration is not to be found in the Philips Reference Designs for CD-Players and DAC's however, the average cost-obsessed Multibit DAC is somewhat redundant, as they have been almost entirely replaced with the other type of DAC, the one I refer to as THRESHOLDING DAC.

Multibit DAC's include the Philips TDA 1540, TDA 1541, TDA 1541A, TDA 1543, TDA 1545, AD 667 and AD 1865 (Analog Devices) and AD1865 and PMD (Philips) (AD 1543 and 1543). Others exist and are of the above Manufacturers also made custom chips for large OEM Manufacturers, such as Sony, Technics, Pioneer, Yamaha, JVC, Marantz, Denon, Sharp, Kenwood, Akai, Hitachi and Mitsubishi to name but a few.

In the extreme High-End Equipment (Spectral, Mark Levinson, Krell, Audio Synthesis and Wadey Multibit DAC's are still the order of the day. Multibit DAC Modules are also available from companies such as Audio Note (UK) and Audio Note (Japan) for use in valve equipment.

Although Multibit DAC's are cheap and relatively easy to design, they suffer from a number of inherent problems. Most important is the fact that the switches correspond to the Bits of the Digital Word are not perfect. Even the best switches have a finite resistance when closed and a finite resistance when open. Furthermore, the switches are not perfectly matched for their resistance when closed and their resistance when open. Also, the switches are not perfectly matched for their switching speed. Finally, the switches are not perfectly matched for their temperature coefficient. Because of these imperfections, the switches do not switch the exact amount of current that they are supposed to switch. Instead, they switch a current that is close to the desired current. The result is that the output current is not exactly proportional to the digital word. Instead, it is close to the desired current. The difference between the desired current and the actual current is called "Differential Nonlinearity". Differential Nonlinearity is the most important source of distortion in Multibit DAC's.

3. Timeslicing (or Delta Sigma) DAC

The device I call Timeslicing DAC is known by many Names. Technics calls it "MASH", Pioneer calls it "PeakOne" and Philips calls it Bitstream and so on. Though, for the purpose of this Article I shall refer to it as Timeslicing DAC.

Instead of attempting to make precision analogue silicon (always expensive), they circumvent the issue by using only one "on/off" switch and it's associated RF Noise. Such a switch is far easier to implement in silicon and is inherently linear. Furthermore, the switch is never open or closed for any length of time, but is always switching between open and closed.

For now start reading, the Philips TDA 1541 DAC Pin-out as well as the above a time domain plot of the Voltage. Depending if we emit the positive going pulse or the negative going pulse we will get a deflection to the positive or negative side.

Now for this to work Philips and Sony Digital Audio Laboratories apparently respect (2^Number of Bits)/256) pulses for every 44.1kHz Sample. That means we need theoretically a 2MHz MHz (or about 2.8 GHz) Clock to run the DAC. This is clearly not practical and a number of mathematical "tricks" (oversampling upsampling, Noise Shaping and so on) are employed to get to lower Clock Rates (around 6MHz for the TDA 1541).

Usually the DAC Chip switches the PSU Voltage (+5V) and in order to make the output more immune from the PSU noise all Timeslicing DAC's are differential, using a Balanced Output. Sometimes the Output is converted to single ended on the databoard. The output is then voltage biased and usually carry a 2.5V DC offset and have a swing each of +/-1.4V peak or 1V RMS. This enough voltage to require no further amplification.

These two outputs must be combined and emitted as a single-ended signal and four further unique Philips Reference Designs is needed as the signal is overlain with large quantities of ultrasonic noise. This is actually much more problematic than the already problematic situation with Multibit DAC's. At a minimum a second order Low Pass Filter is required to remove the worst of the RF Noise. Philips TDA 1541 DAC's employ a somewhat more sophisticated system: part of the output stage (the Op-Amp) is used to form a Second Order Low Pass Filter (LPF). Philips TDA 1543 DAC's employ an incorporated switched capacitor lowpass filter (sinks passive) and lossy CMOS Op-Amp output buffers.

While these measures are adequate for most applications, they are not for the more discriminating and hardened designer cannot screw up the sound of the chip too much, they seriously measure the inherent sound of the device. This makes (all other things being equal and a competently designed Timeslicing DAC will measure better than a competently designed Multibit DAC) the Timeslicing DAC the preferred choice for valve designers. Philips TDA 1541 DAC's are the most commonly found in CD-Players and DAC's.

A number of recent Timeslicing DAC have gone further and even incorporated the rest of the analogue stage into the chip (Philips TDA1305 and Burr-Brown PCM 1704 DAC's). Philips TDA 1305 DAC's even go as far as to have a built in Headphone Amplifier on the Chip! Sound on chip are not your audiophile favorites. On the contrary, with Philips it is of course the equivalent of a M13332. Burr Brown did not go to such extremes and their PCM 1704 DAC's are highly regarded in the Hi-Fi Industry and are found in many CD-Players.

Of course, these On-Amp's are cement use. Nor can you bypass them anymore. They are always there and inside the Black Box you think of as "Digital".

But back to basics. The big advantage of the Timeslicing DAC is that it is an almost pure digital circuit. And all everything can be done in the digital domain, so no noisy and distorting analogue circuitry. The only analogue circuitry required is that used for the databoard of the DAC (used primarily in Asian gear) and the Output Stage. Timeslicing DAC usually require only one and the Output Stage is also quite simple.

Philips Bitstream Chip's (like TDA1305) are famous for having option emulated by some bit wheel like integrated a analogue stage based on the TDA1306 Bitstream Chip. Philips recommend a simple Op-Amp stage for the output of the chip (Low Cost Logic and Serial Bus). Also the Philips CSCOG, which is their post digital output (and other devices) use a sound good in the recommended Output Stage and Philips even offer an integrated stereo part of the output stage (the Op-Amp and the Bias Circuit) in the form of the TDA1304 Chip. Philips Bitstream DAC's are also incorporated switched capacitor lowpass filters (sonic poison) and lossy CMOS Op-Amp output buffers.

Philips recommend a simple Op-Amp stage for the output of the chip (Low Cost Logic and Serial Bus). Also the Philips CSCOG, which is their post digital output (and other devices) use a sound good in the recommended Output Stage and Philips even offer an integrated stereo part of the output stage (the Op-Amp and the Bias Circuit) in the form of the TDA1304 Chip. Philips Bitstream DAC's are also incorporated switched capacitor lowpass filters (sonic poison) and lossy CMOS Op-Amp output buffers.

4. Analogue Stage Requirements

After having discussed the different types of DAC we can now sit down and formulate a few basic requirements for analogue stages (valid state or otherwise) which we can then use to design our Valve Output Stage.

An analogue stage for current output (Multibit) DAC's requires a low input impedance (the lower the better - about 100 to 200 Ohms appears to be a sensible maximum), a fairly high voltage gain and while it must withstand some notable HF Noise, no extreme lowpass filtering is required.

This suggests a resistive load, a moderate amplification pentode or pentode/triode and a fairly direct coupling to the following stage. Solutions for this have been long available and what is presented below for Multibit converters is merely a rehash of other peoples work with the odd little touch from me here and there.

An analogue stage for timeslicing (Bitstream/Delta Sigma) DAC's requires a very low voltage gain, suitable RF Filtering to protect following stages from HF Noise and a fairly high input impedance. Valve noise is not a problem as the signal has already been amplified by the DAC's internal amplifiers. Distortion is the latter by the way.

I have seen one solution (by Chris Freund) which uses differential MPP valve stages but ends up with by far too much gain, excessive output voltage and a substantially unnecessary complexity. Another other ingenious solution (Stephane Peregrin) was to use a transformer, which of course works great, although not everybody can afford the cost. Also, the transformer will limit the bandwidth and introduce its own colouration of the sound.

Which each solution has it's merits, one is too complex, and has too many glowing bottles while the other is really ingenious but has no glowing bottles and relies upon a transformer for the voltage gain. Both are not suitable for the average constructor and I have set out to design a solution that is somewhat 40k less-level transformer can easily exceed 4.0 and the hum from most screen cost several hundred dollars each.

The solution presented here is a compromise between the two. It uses a transformer to provide the voltage gain, but keeps the turn/ratio down to one-to-one still notice anyway." So the output valve only has to provide the balanced part. Some form of lowpass filtering is needed together with a DC Blocking Cap. The load resistor is made relatively low to keep the distortion down and the valve is run in triode mode to keep the distortion down and to limit introduced a level load resistor. This works and sounds very good indeed.

All this said, valve amplification purists (perfectly understandable) can use an input impedance of 47kOhm or higher) we can completely omit AN analogue stage for Timeslicing DAC's and use only a simple passive circuit, avoiding any additional active components. This is especially true for recent devices from Burr-Brown (PCM 1704 DAC's) and Philips (TDA1305 DAC's) which have a relatively low output impedance.

Also for Multibit DAC's it is possible to completely avoid active analogue stages if the following amplification chain has enough open gain (sometimes possible with valve amplifiers but rarely with Solid State Amplifiers).

The cases where one can afford to operate without external analogue stage are comparably rare though. I might discuss the "DAC-Direct" Output topology I have developed for my own Valve Amplifiers in a future Article, if there is any interest.

"Three Microvolt (3^6), usually a Marketing Manager, a Helpless Manager and a Software Engineer drive down the Autobahn in a BMW. The Car suddenly stops. The Engineer says: "I know what the problem is, the Fuel Pump has failed." The Manager says: "Let's call the local dealer, he'll send a man." The Helpless, maybe they can drop us a new Wheel?." Finally the Software Engineer says: "What's all the fuss about, guy's? Just get in and hope for driving, reverse and stop, that's all I need."

Practical Implementations

1. I've got the Power - a powersupply digression

Prior to launching into a lengthy discussion of the specific example circuits for analogue stages let's briefly review a simple, fairly inexpensive but very effective power supply for valve circuitry. Such a power supply is suitable for all the circuits presented here.

Maplin have an inexpensive Valve Mains Transformer in their program, as well as inexpensive but adequate chokes. Used for this PSU is one M2X Mains Transformer (around £14.00) and two M25F Filter Chokes (around £7.00 each). Other sources exist, but I seriously doubt that a cheaper 2.5kV choke and a suitable mains Transformer can be obtained for less than £30.00. The circuit for the power supply is shown below:

Most other components are standard industrial quality ones. The electrolytic capacitors in the HT Supply should be of high quality but it is not necessary to spring for Elna Cerafine's or Black Gate's. The lowest cost suggested devices are Nichicon VX Series axial types, available from good electronic stockists.

The Circuit for the Supply is given below.

I believe one or two unusual features in this supply need explaining. First looking at the HT Supply there are a number of unusual networks around the heavy standard rectifier valve and it's associated reservoir capacitor. The rectifier valve is protected by a spluttering sound in the circuit. In order to allow an otherwise the core will have. I have myself used these chokes for up to 40mA choke input supplies in the described manner and failure with no ill effects. Using one of the more powerful rectifiers will require a choke with a higher current rating.

The rest of the circuit is long standard, though the wire fuses in the audience might want to replace the 1k filter resistor pressing the 225uF main reservoir capacitor with a 1k5 resistor. The Mains Supply has a key bonus for the valve user. Not shown here but shown in the circuit for each individual channel will be shown in the schematic for the analogue stage. In any case there will be a 22uF Axial Supercanacitor or Solion polypropylene capacitor connected from the HT Line to Ground.

It should be noted that the above PSU Design is hardly ultimate or in any way meant out. Significant improvements can be applied. However, the above circuit will be found to be adequate for most purposes. Also, the above circuit will be found to be adequate for most purposes. Also, the above circuit will be found to be adequate for most purposes. Also